

City of Bayside

Revised September 2012



Two Individual Citations

Prepared for the City of Bayside

Contents

Contents		2
Consultants		3
Executive Summary		4
1.0	Introduction	5
1.1	Background	5
1.2	Methodology and Sources	5
1.3	Levels of Significance and Definitions	5
1.0	Individual Citations	7
1.1	39 Sandringham Road, Sandringham	8
1.2	1 Fernhill Road North, Sandringham	12

Consultants

This review was undertaken by:

Bryce Raworth Pty Ltd
Conservation Consultants
Architectural Historians

Text and illustrations were prepared by Bryce Raworth and Carolynne Baker.

Executive Summary

This review report finds that:

1. Both individual properties – namely 39 Sandringham Road, Sandringham, and 1 Fernhill Road North, Sandringham – were found to be of sufficient significance to warrant the introduction of a Heritage Overlay control.
2. Council resolved on 11 September 2012 to abandon the proposed heritage controls for the former St Luke’s Anglican Church at 398 Bay Street, Brighton. Reference to this property, including the citation prepared has therefore subsequently been removed from this document as part of the September 2012 revisions.
3. It is recommended that the properties at 39 Sandringham Road, Sandringham, and 1 Fernhill Road North, Sandringham, be prepared for inclusion in Council’s Heritage Policy under Clause 22.05 as per other listings for heritage sites.

1.0

Introduction

1.1 Background

This review of selected heritage sites in Bayside was commissioned by Bayside City Council. It seeks to assess whether the two properties that were the subject of individual citations continue to warrant their respective proposed heritage overlays: namely the buildings at 39 Sandringham Road, Sandringham, and 1 Fernhill Road North, Sandringham.

1.2 Methodology and Sources

Limited primary historical research has been undertaken for the purposes of this report as much of the relevant information has already been outlined in documents such as: Allom Lovell & Associates' *City of Bayside Heritage Review: Heritage Overlay Precincts*, Vol.3 (1999); Andrew C Ward & Associates' *City of Sandringham Heritage Conservation Study* (1989), and the *City of Brighton Urban Character and Conservation Study* by Perrott Lyon Mathieson in association with Andrew Ward (1986).

Each individual building was re-assessed and a survey of visible external fabric undertaken. Particular note was taken of changes that have occurred since the 2007 citations were prepared. The criteria used to assess each building are outlined in the following section. The assessment helped determine whether each individual building was of sufficient significance to warrant an individual heritage control.

The existing citations for the buildings were then revised and augmented as necessary.

1.3 Levels of significance and definitions

Since the introduction of the first municipal heritage conservation studies in the 1970s, there have been numerous attempts to define an appropriate means of categorising sites of significance in terms of levels of significance. Nonetheless, it is clear that a broad range of factors can contribute to making a place significant.

The City of Bayside has adopted the HERCON assessment criteria for assessing significance.* These are as follows:

- Criterion A:* Importance to the course or pattern of our cultural or natural history.
- Criterion B:* Possession of uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of our cultural or natural history.
- Criterion C:* Potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of our cultural or natural history.
- Criterion D:* Importance in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of cultural or natural places or environments.

- Criterion E:* Importance in exhibiting particular aesthetic characteristics.
- Criterion F:* Importance in demonstrating a high degree of creative or technical achievement at a particular period.
- Criterion G:* Strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group for social, cultural or spiritual reasons. This includes the significance of a place to Indigenous peoples as part of their continuing and developing cultural traditions.
- Criterion H:* Special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in our history.

** This list is advisory and general, and is not considered exhaustive.*

Buildings that are subject to individual heritage controls are assessed as having met some or several of the HERCON assessment criteria, at a level of either state or local importance. Buildings in this category will usually be fine examples of their type, era or style, and may help demonstrate the development of their immediate area in one or several periods. They will usually retain a substantial degree of their original fabric or appearance, and any such additions as are visible will usually either be sympathetic to the character of the original, or will demonstrate either a typical or notable type of building alteration from another era.

The individual citations for the properties at 39 Sandringham Road, Sandringham, and 1 Fernhill Road North, Sandringham, remain unchanged following an external inspection of the two properties. All sources have been acknowledged.

2.0

Individual citations

6.1

39 Sandringham Road, Sandringham



Address	39 Sandringham Road
Date of construction	1905-6
Original owner	Mrs Cordelia Whitelaw
Original Use	Residence
Current use	Residence
Architect	Unknown
Builder	Unknown

Listings and controls

Victorian Heritage Register	Yes <input type="checkbox"/>	No <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Register of the National Estate	Yes <input type="checkbox"/>	No <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

Register of the National Trust (Victoria)

Yes

No

History

The land on which 39 Sandringham Road stands once formed part of Samuel Jackson's portion 22, alienated in 1852. Jackson was a noted early architect while his brother, William, is of note for having landed at Red Bluff as a member of John Pascoe Fawkner's exploration party almost two decades earlier. Somewhat unusually, Jackson did not subdivide and the land was sold to Roger Leech following Samuel Jackson's death in 1878. Leech, a land agent, fenced the land and named it Fernhill but later subdivided and sold 31 acres to David Abbott in 1881. Abbott – a Shire councillor and solicitor – owned the neighbouring property Coggeshall at 92 Beach Road. In 1886, Abbott held his own land sales offering seventy house lots. Further auctions were held in 1888.

The property at 39 Sandringham Road was part of the land released in Abbott's 'Sandringham Estate' subdivision of 1888, extending from Abbott Street in the north to Sandringham Road in the south, and Mock St in the east to Waltham and Melrose Streets in the west. At first, development was slow. By 1900, only a few houses had been constructed: three in Trentham Street, one in Abbott Street, and two in Fernhill Road. However intensive residential development soon followed these tentative beginnings and by 1905, the Sandringham Estate boasted a number of new properties including seven houses on the east side of Trentham Street and one on the west, four houses in Sandringham Road, ten in Abbott Street and eight in Fernhill Road.

The residence at 39 Sandringham Road was most likely one of the four residences constructed by this time. The property, originally known as 'Keighley', first appears in the Sands and McDougall Directories in 1906, occupied by Mrs Cordelia Whitelaw. The Whitelaws occupied the property for many years, although by 1930 the property had been passed onto Miss Margaret Whitelaw.

Description

Constructed in 1905-6, 'Keighley' at 39 Sandringham Road is a distinctive example of the timber Edwardian Queen Anne style. The double storey weatherboard villa is a picturesque composition of hipped and gabled roofs clad in terracotta tiles, half timbered gabled ends, projecting bay windows, timber fretwork and tall red brick chimneys with terracotta pots. Most prominently, an attic storey gabled bay with a generous canted bay window projects out toward Sandringham Road. Above the canted bay is a small balcony bordered by a timber balustrade. The building addresses the corner of Mock Street and Sandringham Road with a return verandah supported on turned timber posts. The hipped roof extends down unbroken over the verandah. Windows are timber-framed and multi-paned but take a variety of different forms. The roof is crowned by ornamental terracotta ridge cresting and finials. Keighley sits within leafy garden surrounds. A sympathetic timber fence borders the front of property.

Condition

Excellent Good Fair Poor Ruins

Integrity

Substantially Intact Altered Sympathetically
 Altered Unsympathetically Damaged

Statement of significance

While certainly not unknown or extraordinary, large examples of timber Federation villas were less common in Melbourne than those constructed of brick. In fact, the Federation style is often characterised as being '[e]ssentially a heavy brick style'¹, 'pre-eminently of terracotta roofing tiles and exposed bricks of a deeper red.'² While this is something of an oversimplification when considered in a national context, in Melbourne it largely holds true. To some extent, the privileging of brick was enforced by local regulations of the time, many of which prohibited building in timber. Clearly, however, Sandringham was not constrained by such regulations and the Sandringham Estate boasts a number of handsome timber Federation villas.

'Keighley', at 39 Sandringham Road, is of architectural significance as a handsome representative example of Sandringham's first period of residential development (HERCON Criterion A) (HERCON Criterion E). Additionally, it is of some historic significance for marking the south-eastern extent of the original Sandringham Estate subdivision which ran as far east as Mock Street.

Recommendation

It is recommended that an individual Heritage Overlay control be introduced over 'Keighley' at 39 Sandringham Road.

City of Bayside Planning Scheme

Recommended for inclusion in a heritage overlay to the Planning Scheme?

	Yes	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No	<input type="checkbox"/>
Should external paint controls apply?	Yes	<input type="checkbox"/>	No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Should internal alteration controls apply?	Yes	<input type="checkbox"/>	No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Should tree controls apply?	Yes	<input type="checkbox"/>	No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

¹ Robin Boyd, *Australia's Home*, p68.

² Bernard Smith cited in Trevor Howells, 'In Search of a Grand National Style', *Towards the Dawn*, p13.

Other Listings and Controls

Recommended for inclusion on the Victorian Heritage Register?	Yes	<input type="checkbox"/>	No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Recommended for inclusion on the Register of the National Estate?	Yes	<input type="checkbox"/>	No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Recommended for inclusion on the National Trust (Victoria) Register?	Yes	<input type="checkbox"/>	No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

Sources

MMBW Property Service Plan and map

Brighton Rate Books

Sands and McDougall Directories, held at the University of Melbourne.

6.2

1 Fernhill Rd North, Sandringham



Address	1 Fernhill Road North
Date of construction	1900-1901
Original owner	Osmand H Wilson
Original Use	Residence
Current use	Residence
Architect	Unknown
Builder	Unknown

Listings and controls

Victorian Heritage Register	Yes <input type="checkbox"/>	No <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Register of the National Estate	Yes <input type="checkbox"/>	No <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Register of the National Trust (Victoria)	Yes <input type="checkbox"/>	No <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

History

The land on which 1 Fernhill Road North stands once formed part of Samuel Jackson's portion 22, alienated in 1852. Jackson was a noted early architect while his brother, William, is of note for having landed at Red Bluff as a member of John Pascoe Fawkner's exploration party almost two decades earlier. Somewhat unusually, Jackson did not subdivide and the land was sold to Roger Leech following Samuel Jackson's death in 1878. Leech, a land agent, fenced the land and named it Fernhill but later subdivided and sold 31 acres to David Abbott in 1881. Abbott – a Shire councillor and solicitor – owned the neighbouring property Coggeshall at 92 Beach Road. In 1886, Abbott held his own land sales offering seventy house lots. Further auctions were held in 1888.

The property at 1 Fernhill Road North was part of the land released in Abbott's 'Sandringham Estate' subdivision of 1888, extending from Abbott Street in the north to Sandringham Road in the south, and Mock St in the east to Waltham and Melrose Streets in the west. At first, development was slow. By 1900, only a few houses had been constructed: three in Trentham Street, one in Abbott Street, and two in Fernhill Road – one occupied by Thomas Brown (now 7 Fernhill Road North), the other vacant. This vacant house on Fernhill Road is the house now known as 1 Fernhill Road North. Although the house at 1 Fernhill Road is one of the earlier buildings on the Sandringham Estate, rapid residential development soon followed these tentative beginnings and by 1905, the Estate boasted a number of new properties.

Sands and McDougall directories show that a man by the name of Osmand H Wilson had moved into the house by 1901. Wilson remained at this address for more than thirty years. It seems, however, that the property was owned by Miss Fanny Hiscox, who owned land lots 100.101 on the east side of Fernhill Road between Abbott Street and Sandringham Road. The MMBW Property Service Plan of 1911 shows that two villas had been constructed on the land by this time – both the residence at 1 Fernhill Road North, and the neighbouring house to the south, 'Almondsbury' (c1905-7). The property extended right through to Mock Street.

Description

The residence at 1 Fernhill Road North is a single storey asymmetrical weatherboard Edwardian Queen Anne villa. The line of the terracotta clad hipped roof extends down unbroken over the verandah roof. A slightly off-centre projecting gabled bay interrupts the continuity of this verandah, effectively dividing it into two – one half runs along the front of the house, while the other returns along the side elevation. Both are supported on turned timber posts and feature solid timber valances with fretworked edging. The gable end is of roughcast render and half timbering. The projecting bay has a rectangular canted bay which is sheltered by a terracotta and timber window hood. Windows are typically timber-framed with double-hung sashes. Two tall red brick chimneys protrude from the roof, one of which has a terracotta pot, while the roof is finished with terracotta ridge cresting and finials.

A small cream brick garage has been built to the north of the building, while a matching low cream brick fence borders the front of the property. Both of these appear to date from the interwar period,

as does the layout of the front garden itself. Despite these additions, the residence at 1 Fernhill Road North is largely intact and appears to be in good condition.

Condition

Excellent Good Fair Poor Ruins

Integrity

Substantially Intact Altered Sympathetically
Altered Unsympathetically Damaged

Statement of significance

While certainly not unknown or extraordinary, large examples of timber Federation villas were less common in Melbourne than those constructed of brick. In fact, the Federation style is often characterised as being '[e]ssentially a heavy brick style,'³ 'pre-eminently of terracotta roofing tiles and exposed bricks of a deeper red.'⁴ While this is something of an oversimplification when considered in a national context, in Melbourne it holds largely true. To some extent, the privileging of brick was enforced by local regulations of the time, many of which prohibited building in timber. Clearly, however, Sandringham was not constrained by such regulations and the Sandringham Estate boasts a number of handsome timber Federation villas.

The Federation villa at 1 Fernhill Road North stands as a handsome representative example of Sandringham's first period of residential development (HERCON Criterion A) (HERCON Criterion E). Additionally, it stands with the neighbouring buildings at 3, 5 and 7 Fernhill Road North as a remnant marker of the original Sandringham Estate's easternmost extent, all four houses having once run between Fernhill Road North and Mock Street to the rear.

Recommendation

It is recommended that an individual Heritage Overlay control be introduced over the property at 1 Fernhill Road North.

³ Robin Boyd, *Australia's Home*, p68.

⁴ Bernard Smith cited in Trevor Howells, 'In Search of a Grand National Style', *Towards the Dawn*, p13.

City of Bayside Planning Scheme				
Recommended for inclusion in a heritage overlay to the Planning Scheme?	Yes	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No	<input type="checkbox"/>
Should external paint controls apply?	Yes	<input type="checkbox"/>	No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Should internal alteration controls apply?	Yes	<input type="checkbox"/>	No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Should tree controls apply?	Yes	<input type="checkbox"/>	No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

Other Listings and Controls				
Recommended for inclusion on the Victorian Heritage Register?	Yes	<input type="checkbox"/>	No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Recommended for inclusion on the Register of the National Estate?	Yes	<input type="checkbox"/>	No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Recommended for inclusion on the National Trust (Victoria) Register?	Yes	<input type="checkbox"/>	No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

Sources
Robin Boyd. <i>Australia's Home</i> . 1978 [1952].
MMBW Plans and Maps
<i>Sands and McDougall Directories</i> , held at the University of Melbourne.